

מסכת גיטין · דף כ"ה ע"ב

Elucidated Talmud · Statement and Proof · Navy & Gold Edition

THE SUGYA

In this daf, we delve deeper into the fascinating and fundamental sugya of breirah (retroactive clarification). The Gemara continues analyzing the machlokes between Rabbi Meir, who holds of breirah even when a person makes the outcome dependent on his own future actions (such as designating teruma and ma'aser on wine), and the other Tanna'im—Rabbi Yehuda, Rabbi Yosei, and Rabbi Shimon—who forbid this because they hold there is no breirah in such a case.

We then explore a crucial distinction in the shita of Rabbi Yehuda and Rabbi Shimon. The Gemara asks whether these Tanna'im, who reject breirah when a person's own future decision is the deciding factor, might actually accept breirah when the outcome depends on the decision of others or on an external event, such as a husband's death or a father's consent to a kiddushin.

All introductions, summaries, and contextual notes are the editor's commentary and are not part of the original text.

MISHNAH מִשְׁנָה

MISHNAH

וּמֵיחֵל וְשׁוֹתָהּ מִיָּד, דְּבָרֵי רַבִּי מֵאִיר.

And he deconsecrates the second tithe that he will separate in the future, transferring its sanctity to money, and he may drink the wine immediately, relying on the separation that he will perform later, which will clarify retroactively which log he designated for the tithes and for teruma. This is the statement of Rabbi Meir.

MISHNAH

רַבִּי יְהוּדָה וְרַבִּי יוֹסֵי וְרַבִּי שִׁמּוֹן שְׂמַעוֹן אוֹסְרִין.

However, Rabbi Yehuda and Rabbi Yosei and Rabbi Shimon prohibit this practice, as they hold that in this case there is no retroactive clarification.

GEMARA גְּמָרָא

STATEMENT

תוֹלָה בְּדַעַת אֲחֵרִים אֵית לֵיהּ בְּרִירָה – דִּתְנִן:

But in a case where one makes the outcome dependent on the decision of others, Rabbi Yehuda accepts the principle of retroactive clarification, as we learned in a mishna:

QUESTION

מָה הִיא בְּאוֹתָן הַיָּמִים?

In a case where an ill husband says to his wife: This is your bill of divorce from now if I die due to this illness, **what is her** halakhic status **in those days** between when the bill of divorce was given but before the husband died?

ANSWER

רבי יהודה אומר: הרי היא כפאהשת איש לכל דבריה, ולכי מיית הוי גיטא.

Rabbi Yehuda says: She is like a married woman with regard to all of her matters, and she remains forbidden to other men; and when he will die, it is a bill of divorce. Since Rabbi Yehuda agrees that the bill of divorce takes effect retroactively, he evidently holds that there is retroactive clarification where one makes the clarification dependent on the decision of others.

QUESTION

אמר ליה רב משרשייא לרבא: הא רבי שמעון, דתולה בדעת עצמו לית ליה ברירה, ותולה בדעת אחרים אית ליה ברירה!

Rav Mesharshiyya said to Rava: But isn't there Rabbi Shimon, who, in a case where one makes the outcome dependent on his own decision, does not accept the principle of retroactive clarification, but when one makes it dependent on the decision of others, he accepts the principle of retroactive clarification?

EXPLANATION

תולה בדעת עצמו לית ליה ברירה – הא דאמרן.

The Gemara elaborates: When one makes the outcome dependent on his own decision, he does not accept the principle of retroactive clarification; this is that which we said in the case of wine purchased from Samaritans.

STATEMENT

תולה בדעת אחרים אית ליה ברירה – דתנא:

And when one makes the outcome dependent on the decision of others, he accepts the principle of retroactive clarification, as it is taught in a baraita:

BRAISA

”הריני בועליך על מנת שירצה אבא”; אף על פי שלא רצה האב – מקודשת.

If a man said to a woman: I am engaging in sexual intercourse with you on the condition that my father will desire our betrothal, and then he married her without specification, then even though the father did not desire it, she is nevertheless betrothed through this act of intercourse.

BRAISA

רבי שמעון בן יהודה אומר משום רבי שמעון: רצה האב – מקודשת,

Rabbi Shimon ben Yehuda says in the name of Rabbi Shimon: If the father desires it, she is betrothed, which shows that Rabbi Shimon accepts retroactive clarification when dependent on others.

SUMMARY

The Gemara demonstrates that Rabbi Yehuda accepts breirah when the outcome depends on an external factor, as seen in the case of a husband who gives a get 'from now if I die from this illness,' where Rabbi Yehuda rules that the get retroactively takes effect upon his death. Similarly, Rav Mesharshiyya suggests to Rava that Rabbi Shimon also distinguishes between a person's own decision—where he rejects breirah, as in the case of the Samaritan wine—and the decision of others. This is

proven from a baraita regarding a conditional kiddushin dependent on the father's approval, where Rabbi Shimon rules that if the father ultimately desires the marriage, she is retroactively betrothed.

לְמַעַן WHAT TO TAKE HOME

In our sugya, the Gemara delves into the deep concept of breirah, retroactive clarification. We see a fascinating distinction made by Rabbi Yehuda and Rabbi Shimon: when a person tries to make a status depend retroactively on their own future choices, we say there is no breirah. But when they make it depend on the decision of others, like a father's consent or the ultimate decree of Heaven, we do say there is breirah.

There is a profound lesson in avodah here. When we try to control everything ourselves, relying solely on our own future whims and plans, our lives lack stability and clarity. We cannot build a solid spiritual foundation on the shifting sands of our own future moods. But when we anchor our lives in the will of others, whether by showing deference to our parents, seeking the guidance of our rabbeim, or ultimately surrendering our desires to the will of the Aibershter, there is a retroactive clarity that settles over everything we do.

When you live with the mindset of "on the condition that my father desires it", submitting your own ego to a higher authority, Hashem retroactively blesses and clarifies your path. What seemed uncertain and chaotic suddenly falls into place, because you aligned your will with something greater than yourself.

Today, before making a decision or reacting to a situation, pause and ask yourself: "Am I just doing what I want in this moment, or am I acting in a way that aligns with the will of Hashem and the guidance of my rabbeim?"